

EY Tax Alert

HC holds sale of partly constructed mall on “as-is-where-is” basis is not leviable to GST

EY Alerts cover significant tax news, developments and changes in legislation that affect Indian businesses. They act as technical summaries to keep you on top of the latest tax issues. For more information, please contact your EY advisor.

Executive summary

This Tax Alert summarizes the recent ruling of the Karnataka High Court (HC)¹ regarding levy of Goods and Services Tax (GST) on partly constructed mall sold on as-is-where-is basis.

The key observations of the HC are:

- ▶ Entry 5 of the Schedule III read with Section 7(2) of the CGST Act (Central Goods and Services Tax Act, 2017) is only by way of “*ex abundanti cautela*” to show the Legislative intent not to tax sale of land and building.
- ▶ Insisting taxation on partly constructed building on as-is-where-is condition, on the ground that completion certificate is yet to be received will not reflect the true nature of the transaction, as entry 5(b) of Schedule II apply only to agreements meant to provide construction services.
- ▶ There is a distinction between contract for rendering construction services and contract for sale of building, *albeit* incomplete, but as a building per se.

The former is amenable to the GST regime while the latter is amenable to the stamp duty regime.
- ▶ Entry 5(b) is merely a service contract simpliciter and not a composite works contract as under entry 6(a) of the Schedule II.
- ▶ At later stage, depending on whether the recipient of such partly constructed property would hire a contractor or build himself for subsequent completion, the levy under GST law may or may not get attracted.

Basis above, HC held that Revenue made a fundamental error in assuming jurisdiction to tax a sale of mall on “as-is-where-is basis”, even if not completed.

¹ WP No. 12700 of 2023



Background

- ▶ The petitioner is engaged in development of commercial and residential real estate projects.
- ▶ Another company, operating in similar line of business, liquidated a partly constructed mall to the petitioner as insolvency proceedings were initiated against it.
- ▶ A sale deed was executed between the liquidator and the petitioner for such property on as-is-where-is basis.
- ▶ Petitioner paid the tax under protest and later applied for a refund, claiming there was no supply based on entry 5 of the Schedule III to the CGST Act (Central Goods and Services Tax Act, 2017).
- ▶ However, Revenue rejected the refund application, on the ground of it being a supply of construction services by the liquidator under entry 5(b) of the Schedule II to the CGST Act.
- ▶ Aggrieved, the Petitioner filed an appeal before the Karnataka High Court (HC).

High Court Ruling

- ▶ Entry 5(b) of Schedule II to the CGST Act provides construction services to be a supply of services which reads as follows:

"(b) construction of a complex, building, civil structure or a part thereof, including a complex or building intended for sale to a buyer, wholly or partly, except where the entire consideration has been received after issuance of completion certificate, where required, by the competent authority or after its first occupation, whichever is earlier."

- ▶ Section 7(2) of the CGST Act starts with a non-obstante clause and excludes activities or transactions specified in Schedule III as neither supply of goods nor services.

Entry 5 of Schedule III covers *"Sale of land and, subject to clause (b) of paragraph 5 of Schedule II, sale of building."*

Aforesaid entry is only by way of *"ex abundanti cautela"* (i.e., excess of caution does no harm) to show the Legislative intent not to tax sale of land and completed building.

- ▶ On conjoint reading of the 7th GST Council meeting and Supreme Court (SC) ruling in the case of VKC Footsteps India Pvt Ltd², there is distinction in contract for rendering construction services and

contract for sale of building, *albeit* incomplete, but as a building per se.

The former would be amenable to the GST regime while the latter would be amenable to the stamp duty regime.

- ▶ For a contract to be under Entry 5(b), there should be a *consensus ad idem* between the parties that service provider would provide construction services to the service recipient. Further, payments should have been made and received before the completion certificate.

If these conditions are absent, it would fall under Schedule III as a sale of building simpliciter.

- ▶ Insisting taxation on building on as-is-where-is condition based on the ground that completion certificate is yet to be received, will not reflect the true nature of the transaction, as entry 5(b) apply only to agreements meant to provide construction services.
- ▶ Further, entry 6(a) of the Schedule II provides that the works contract services are supply of services.

Basis SC judgment in the case of Larsen & Toubro Ltd³, entry 5(b) is a service contract simpliciter and not a composite works contract under entry 6(a).

- ▶ SC in the case of Larsen & Toubro Ltd.⁴ held that the activity of construction undertaken by the developer/builder is works contract only from the stage the developer enters in to a contract with the flat purchaser and that it is only the value additions made to the goods transferred after the agreement is entered into with the purchaser, be made chargeable to tax by the Government.
- ▶ The subsequent completion of such property may or may not attract GST depending on whether the recipient would hire a contractor or build himself.
- ▶ Thus, HC held that the Revenue made fundamental error in assuming jurisdiction to tax a sale of mall on "as-is-where-is basis", even if not completed.
- ▶ Accordingly, appeal was allowed, and refund was granted to petitioner.

² 2021 (52) GSTL 513 (SC)

³ 2015 (39) STR 913 (SC)/ (2016) 1 SCC 170

⁴ (2014)1 SCC 708

Comments

- a. The ruling offers much needed clarity on the taxability of transactions involving partially constructed properties. This may significantly reduce litigation within the real estate sector.
- b. Businesses may consider the potential applicability of this ruling to the taxability of leasehold rights and transfer of development rights (TDR), being subjected to stamp duty.
- c. The Revenue authorities may not universally agree with this interpretation across all transaction types. For instance, transactions involving subsequent transfer of partially constructed flats could warrant further examination to understand the implications of this ruling.

Our offices

Ahmedabad

22nd Floor, B Wing, Privilon
Ambli BRT Road, Behind Iskcon Temple
Off SG Highway
Ahmedabad - 380 059
Tel: + 91 79 6608 3800

8th Floor, Building No. 14A
Block 14, Zone 1
Brigade International Financial Centre
GIFT City SEZ
Gandhinagar - 382355, Gujarat
Tel +91 79 6608 3800

Bengaluru

12th & 13th Floor
"UB City", Canberra Block
No.24 Vittal Mallia Road
Bengaluru - 560 001
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

Ground & 1st Floor
11, 'A' wing
Divyasree Chambers
Langford Town
Bengaluru - 560 025
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

3rd & 4th Floor
MARKSQUARE
#61, St. Mark's Road
Shantala Nagar
Bengaluru - 560 001
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

1st & 8th Floor, Tower A
Prestige Shantiniketan
Mahadevapura Post
Whitefield,
Bengaluru - 560 048
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

Bhubaneswar

8th Floor, O-Hub, Tower A
Chandaka SEZ, Bhubaneswar
Odisha - 751024
Tel: + 91 674 274 4490

Chandigarh

Elante offices, Unit No. B-613 & 614
6th Floor, Plot No- 178-178A
Industrial & Business Park, Phase-I
Chandigarh - 160 002
Tel: + 91 172 6717800

Chennai

6th & 7th Floor, A Block,
Tidel Park, No.4, Rajiv Gandhi Salai
Taramani, Chennai - 600 113
Tel: + 91 44 6654 8100

Delhi NCR

Aikyam
Ground Floor
67, Institutional Area
Sector 44, Gurugram - 122 003
Haryana
Tel: +91 124 443 4000

3rd & 6th Floor, Worldmark-1
IGI Airport Hospitality District
Aerocity, New Delhi - 110 037
Tel: + 91 11 4731 8000

4th & 5th Floor, Plot No 2B
Tower 2, Sector 126
Gautam Budh Nagar, U.P.
Noida - 201 304
Tel: + 91 120 671 7000

Hyderabad

THE SKYVIEW 10
18th Floor, "SOUTH LOBBY"
Survey No 83/1, Raidurgam
Hyderabad - 500 032
Tel: + 91 40 6736 2000

Jaipur

9th floor, Jewel of India
Horizon Tower, JLN Marg
Opp Jaipur Stock Exchange
Jaipur, Rajasthan - 302018

Kochi

9th Floor, ABAD Nucleus
NH-49, Maradu PO
Kochi - 682 304
Tel: + 91 484 433 4000

Kolkata

22 Camac Street
3rd Floor, Block 'C'
Kolkata - 700 016
Tel: + 91 33 6615 3400

Mumbai

14th Floor, The Ruby
29 Senapati Bapat Marg
Dadar (W), Mumbai - 400 028
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0000

5th Floor, Block B-2
Nirlon Knowledge Park
Off. Western Express Highway
Goregaon (E)
Mumbai - 400 063
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0000

3rd Floor, Unit No 301
Building No. 1
Mindspace Airoli West (Gigaplex)
Located at Plot No. IT-5
MIDC Knowledge Corridor
Airoli (West)
Navi Mumbai - 400708
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0003

Altimus, 18th Floor
Pandurang Budhkar Marg
Worli, Mumbai - 400 018
Tel: +91 22 6192 0503

Pune

C-401, 4th Floor
Panchshil Tech Park, Yerwada
(Near Don Bosco School)
Pune - 411 006
Tel: + 91 20 4912 6000

10th Floor, Smartworks
M-Agile, Pan Card Club Road
Baner, Taluka Haveli
Pune - 411 045
Tel: + 91 20 4912 6800

Ernst & Young LLP

EY | Building a better working world

EY is building a better working world by creating new value for clients, people, society and the planet, while building trust in capital markets.

Enabled by data, AI and advanced technology, EY teams help clients shape the future with confidence and develop answers for the most pressing issues of today and tomorrow.

EY teams work across a full spectrum of services in assurance, consulting, tax, strategy and transactions. Fueled by sector insights, a globally connected, multi-disciplinary network and diverse ecosystem partners, EY teams can provide services in more than 150 countries and territories.

All in to shape the future with confidence.

EY refers to the global organization, and may refer to one or more, of the member firms of Ernst & Young Global Limited, each of which is a separate legal entity. Ernst & Young Global Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, does not provide services to clients. Information about how EY collects and uses personal data and a description of the rights individuals have under data protection legislation are available via ey.com/privacy. EYG member firms do not practice law where prohibited by local laws. For more information about our organization, please visit ey.com.

Ernst & Young LLP is one of the Indian client serving member firms of EYGM Limited. For more information about our organization, please visit www.ey.com/en_in.

Ernst & Young LLP is a Limited Liability Partnership, registered under the Limited Liability Partnership Act, 2008 in India, having its registered office at Ground Floor, Plot No. 67, Institutional Area, Sector - 44, Gurugram - 122 003, Haryana, India.

© 2025 Ernst & Young LLP. Published in India.
All Rights Reserved.

ED None.

This publication contains information in summary form and is therefore intended for general guidance only. It is not intended to be a substitute for detailed research or the exercise of professional judgment. Neither EYGM Limited nor any other member of the global Ernst & Young organization can accept any responsibility for loss occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any material in this publication. On any specific matter, reference should be made to the appropriate advisor.

ey.com/en_in

 @EY_India  EY  EY India  EY Careers India  @ey_indiacareers



Download the EY India Tax Insights App