

# EY Tax Alert

**Karnataka HC holds that denial of excess FTC without variation in total income cannot result in levy of penalty**

## Executive summary

EY Alerts cover significant tax news, developments and changes in legislation that affect Indian businesses. They act as technical summaries to keep you on top of the latest tax issues. For more information, please contact your EY advisor.

This Tax Alert summarizes a recent decision of the Karnataka High Court (HC) in the case of Mr. Srinivasa Gandhi Sampath (Taxpayer) v. ACIT<sup>1</sup>, wherein the HC quashed a penalty order and held that penalty for under-reporting or misreporting of income cannot be imposed merely because the Taxpayer made an excess claim of foreign tax credit (FTC).

In this case, the Taxpayer's returned income was accepted in the assessment without any variation. However, while computing tax liability, the tax authority disallowed part of FTC made in the return in respect of which tax authority initiated and imposed penalty of under-reported income.

The HC held that the penalty for under-reported income requires variation in total income as returned by the Taxpayer. Absent such variation, penalty cannot be invoked merely on account of reduction in grant of credit for FTC in computing tax liability of the Taxpayer.

<sup>1</sup> WP No. 22802 of 2022 dated 21 November 2025



The better the question.  
The better the answer.  
The better the world works.



**Shape the future  
with confidence**

# Background

- ▶ Under the Income-tax laws<sup>2</sup> (ITL), when a resident taxpayer earns income in a foreign jurisdiction and pays tax thereon in foreign country, the foreign tax so paid is allowed to be claimed as credit against the taxes payable in India (this is popularly known as FTC credit) in accordance with the relevant tax treaty as well as the provisions of the ITL, subject to certain conditions.
- ▶ Separately, ITL provides for levy of penalty if there is under-reporting or misreporting of income by virtue of variation to total income assessed by compared to returned income by the taxpayer. Penalty for underreported income is 50% of tax payable on under-reported income and penalty for misreported income is 200% of such tax payable.

## Facts:

- ▶ The Taxpayer was an employee of an Indian company of a MNC group and worked in India as also abroad. The Taxpayer, an Indian resident, during the relevant tax year, filed a return of income declaring salary income received from Indian employer and claimed a credit of taxes paid outside India amounting to INR 6.8 million.<sup>3</sup>
- ▶ In the scrutiny assessment the tax authority did not make any variation to the total income declared in the tax return. However, in computation of tax liability, it reduced the FTC claim to INR 2.2 million. The Taxpayer did not dispute the same.
- ▶ Subsequently, tax authority passed a penalty order levying penalty on the Taxpayer on the grounds that the Taxpayer had under-reported its income.<sup>4</sup> According to tax authority, the Taxpayer had claimed excess FTC with the intent to evade income tax resulting in under-reporting of total income in India.
- ▶ Aggrieved, the Taxpayer has filed a writ petition before the Karnataka High Court challenging the penalty order.

## Taxpayer's contentions:

- ▶ The penalty under the ITL can be imposed only in cases of underreporting of income and misreporting of income which necessarily requires variation in total income assist as compared in returned income.
- ▶ The tax authority accepted the income declared in the return of income by the Taxpayer without any variation to such total income. There is, therefore, no under-reporting of income involved therein.
- ▶ Errors in the claim of FTC relief while computing tax liability does not amount to underreporting or

misreporting of income, absent any variation in total income. Penal provision of the ITL does not trigger at all.

## Tax authority contentions:

- ▶ The writ is not maintainable since taxpayers have efficacious and alternative remedy available in the form of an appeal.

## HC ruling:

The HC quashed the penalty order and held that penalty can only be invoked in case under-reporting of income and not to the case of availing excess FTC relief without variation in income:

- ▶ Penalty provisions under the ITL have to be strictly construed and such provisions can be invoked and initiated only in the event of the taxpayer being guilty of under-reporting of income.
- ▶ Excess claim of FTC relief does not result in under-reporting of income and, hence, the essential requirements to invoke penalty proceedings is absent in the facts of the case.
- ▶ The HC relied on the Gujarat HC decision in the case of Prafulbhai Vallabhadas Fuletra<sup>5</sup> in support of the proposition that in absence of variation to the returned income, there would be no under-reporting of income and consequently there can be no levy of penalty under the ITL.
- ▶ Reliance was placed also on the Supreme Court (SC) decision in the case of Reliance Petroproducts<sup>6</sup> to hold that mere making of a claim which is not sustainable in law by itself would not amount to furnishing inaccurate particulars or concealment of income. The SC, in this case, was concerned with the erstwhile penalty provisions of the ITL which applied in case of concealment of income by furnishing inaccurate particulars.
- ▶ Further, rejecting tax authority's contention, the HC held that the existence of an alternative remedy does not take away HC's jurisdiction under Article 226 of the Constitution of India. Hence the writ petition was held to be maintainable.

<sup>2</sup> Income-tax Act, 1961 read with Income-tax Rules, 1962

<sup>3</sup> The decision does not elaborate why the salary income was taxable outside India.

<sup>4</sup> There was no allegation of misreporting of income.

<sup>5</sup> [(2023) 157 Taxmann.Com 754 (Gujrat)]

<sup>6</sup> [(2010) 11 SCC 762]

## Comments

The present HC ruling affirms the well-settled legal position that underreported of income presupposes upward variation to total return income. Absent variation, penal provisions of the ITL does not trigger. Consequently, denial of FTC while computing tax liability does not result under-reporting of income so as to trigger penal consequences.

The principles of rulings may also be extended to cases involving mismatch or variation in allowance of credits for tax credit or collected at source or minimum alternate tax (MAT)/alternate minimum tax (AMT) credit entitlement or claim for tax rebate.

# Our offices

## Ahmedabad

22<sup>nd</sup> Floor, B Wing, Privilon  
Ambli BRT Road, Behind Iskcon Temple  
Off SG Highway  
Ahmedabad - 380 059  
Tel: + 91 79 6608 3800

8<sup>th</sup> Floor, Building No. 14A  
Block 14, Zone 1  
Brigade International Financial Centre  
GIFT City SEZ  
Gandhinagar - 382355, Gujarat  
Tel +91 79 6608 3800

## Bengaluru

12<sup>th</sup> & 13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
"UB City", Canberra Block  
No.24 Vittal Mallya Road  
Bengaluru - 560 001  
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

Ground & 1<sup>st</sup> Floor  
# 11, 'A' wing  
Divyasree Chambers  
Langford Town  
Bengaluru - 560 025  
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

3<sup>rd</sup> & 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
MARKSQUARE  
#61, St. Mark's Road  
Shantala Nagar  
Bengaluru - 560 001  
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

1<sup>st</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> Floor, Tower A  
Prestige Shantiniketan  
Mahadevapura Post  
Whitefield,  
Bengaluru - 560 048  
Tel: + 91 80 6727 5000

## Bhubaneswar

8<sup>th</sup> Floor, O-Hub, Tower A  
Chandaka SEZ, Bhubaneswar  
Odisha - 751024  
Tel: + 91 674 274 4490

## Chandigarh

Elante offices, Unit No. B-613 & 614  
6th Floor, Plot No- 178-178A  
Industrial & Business Park, Phase-I  
Chandigarh - 160 002  
Tel: + 91 172 6717800

## Chennai

6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, A Block,  
Tidel Park, No.4, Rajiv Gandhi Salai  
Taramani, Chennai - 600 113  
Tel: + 91 44 6654 8100

## Delhi NCR

Aikyam  
Ground Floor  
67, Institutional Area  
Sector 44, Gurugram - 122 003  
Haryana  
Tel: +91 124 443 4000

3<sup>rd</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Worldmark-1  
IGI Airport Hospitality District  
Aerocity, New Delhi - 110 037  
Tel: + 91 11 4731 8000

4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Plot No 2B  
Tower 2, Sector 126  
Gautam Budh Nagar, U.P.  
Noida - 201 304  
Tel: + 91 120 671 7000

## Hyderabad

THE SKYVIEW 10  
18<sup>th</sup> Floor, "SOUTH LOBBY"  
Survey No 83/1, Raidurgam  
Hyderabad - 500 032  
Tel: + 91 40 6736 2000

## Jaipur

9<sup>th</sup> floor, Jewel of India  
Horizon Tower, JLN Marg  
Opp Jaipur Stock Exchange  
Jaipur, Rajasthan - 302018

## Kochi

9<sup>th</sup> Floor, ABAD Nucleus  
NH-49, Maradu PO  
Kochi - 682 304  
Tel: + 91 484 433 4000

## Kolkata

22 Camac Street  
3rd Floor, Block 'C'  
Kolkata - 700 016  
Tel: + 91 33 6615 3400

## Mumbai

14<sup>th</sup> Floor, The Ruby  
29 Senapati Bapat Marg  
Dadar (W), Mumbai - 400 028  
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0000

5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Block B-2  
Nirlon Knowledge Park  
Off. Western Express Highway  
Goregaon (E)  
Mumbai - 400 063  
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0000

3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Unit No 301  
Building No. 1  
Mindspace Airoli West (Gigaplex)  
Located at Plot No. IT-5  
MIDC Knowledge Corridor  
Airoli (West)  
Navi Mumbai - 400708  
Tel: + 91 22 6192 0003

Altimus, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Pandurang Budhkar Marg  
Worli, Mumbai - 400 018  
Tel: +91 22 6192 0503

## Pune

C-401, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Panchshil Tech Park, Yerwada  
(Near Don Bosco School)  
Pune - 411 006  
Tel: + 91 20 4912 6000

10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Smartworks  
M-Agile, Pan Card Club Road  
Baner, Taluka Haveli  
Pune - 411 045  
Tel: + 91 20 4912 6800

## Ernst & Young LLP

EY | Building a better working world

EY is building a better working world by creating new value for clients, people, society and the planet, while building trust in capital markets.

Enabled by data, AI and advanced technology, EY teams help clients shape the future with confidence and develop answers for the most pressing issues of today and tomorrow.

EY teams work across a full spectrum of services in assurance, consulting, tax, strategy and transactions. Fueled by sector insights, a globally connected, multi-disciplinary network and diverse ecosystem partners, EY teams can provide services in more than 150 countries and territories.

## All in to shape the future with confidence.

EY refers to the global organization, and may refer to one or more, of the member firms of Ernst & Young Global Limited, each of which is a separate legal entity. Ernst & Young Global Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, does not provide services to clients. Information about how EY collects and uses personal data and a description of the rights individuals have under data protection legislation are available via [ey.com/privacy](http://ey.com/privacy). EYG member firms do not practice law where prohibited by local laws. For more information about our organization, please visit [ey.com](http://ey.com).

Ernst & Young LLP is one of the Indian client serving member firms of EYGM Limited. For more information about our organization, please visit [www.ey.com/en\\_in](http://www.ey.com/en_in).

Ernst & Young LLP is a Limited Liability Partnership, registered under the Limited Liability Partnership Act, 2008 in India, having its registered office at Ground Floor, Plot No. 67, Institutional Area, Sector - 44, Gurugram - 122 003, Haryana, India.

© 2025 Ernst & Young LLP. Published in India.  
All Rights Reserved.

ED None.

This publication contains information in summary form and is therefore intended for general guidance only. It is not intended to be a substitute for detailed research or the exercise of professional judgment. Neither EYGM Limited nor any other member of the global Ernst & Young organization can accept any responsibility for loss occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any material in this publication. On any specific matter, reference should be made to the appropriate advisor.

[ey.com/en\\_in](http://ey.com/en_in)



@EY\_India



EY



EY India



EY Careers India



@ey\_indiacareers



Download the EY India Tax Insights App